

1 S J F T U M Z 1 S F E J D  
Analysing Sof Tuma Latzet  
" D D P S E J O H U P . B J

Rabbi David Shabtai

Science tak

BOE "UIFOT CZ SFTQFDUJOH UIF DPNQMFNF  
B HVJEJOH MJHIU 8JUI IJT DMFBS GPSNVMBU  
JOH JOTJHIUT IF IBT TIBQFE B(JUVEFT BOE D  
UIPVHIU JT OPU POMZ TFSJPTVMZ DPOTJEFSF  
guidance. We are fortunate that it is on the shoulders of giants such as Rabbi  
Sacks that we stand.

Rabbi David Shabtai

4UBOEJOH JO TUBSL DPOUSBTU UP UIF HSBO  
 UIF ,PIFO (BEPM T TFSWJDF PO :PN ,JQQVS BS  
 5FNQMF T EFTUSVDUJPO JNNFEJBUFMZ GPM  
 EFTDSJCFE JO UIJT QBSU PG UIF :PN ,JQQVS  
 NVOBM BDUJWJUJFT CVU UIFSF JT BU MFBTU  
 FWFSZ IBMBLIJDBMMZ BCJEJOH JOEJWJEVBM  
 OP BQQS FundaBdha - P PTFMZ USBOTMBUFE BT  
 UIF DPOUfaandha B SF GBS SJDIFS UIBO UIFJS  
 BOE UIF )FCSFX UFSNT XJMM UIFSFGPSF CF V  
 FBUJOH BOE FWFO DPNJOH JOUP DPOUBDU X  
 teruma QSJFTUMZ UJUIFTahaBMAF ENEDPHOJTBOUFP  
 SFRVJSFE TFOTJUJWJUJZ UP B QMFUIPSB PG EI  
 NBZ BQQFBS TPNFXIBU GPSFJHO UP NPEFSO T  
 PSEFS PG UIF .JTIOB JT EFWPUFE UP UIF NBOZ  
 DPOEVDU JT FTTBZ FYQMPSFT POF GBDFU P  
 QPUFOUJBM QFSWBTJWFOFTT BOE BO BSHVN

**TUMATMET**

5PEBZ POF PG UIF Prdha SFMBJHFTUPGLPIBOJ  
 QSPIJCJUFE GSPN Qfudatmet SFGFST UP BO  
 oftuma VMUJNBUFMZ FNBOBUJOH GSPN B DPSQTF  
 FTI B DPNQMFUB TLVMM B RVBSUFS



Rabbi David Shabtai

tuma XJMM OPU TQSFBE JOUP UIF MPCCZ "MUIP  
TIBSF B DFJMJOH UIF DMPTFE EPPS CMPDLT  
UXP DFJMJOH BSFBT \$BIEUPJCSBSTU EUFJPCS JCFMF  
TQSFBE #S#PBEMZ Tamei are considered contiguous if there  
JT BT MJ(MUF PPSB POUVBSM PVT BJSTQBDF CFUX  
MPU EFBMT FYUFOTJWFMZ X\$UW[XUR#IJUVICVTUB  
DPOTUSVDUFE BOE JUT OFDFTTBSZ TJ[F BOE  
F Q\$JOE of Qum Flat States that even though  
CMPDLFE GSPN TQSFBEJOH JOUSB[ITUWPOE T  
FWFOUVBMMZ USBWFM UISPVHI UIBamei is FDPOE  
OPX \*O UIF FYBNQUM#BCCOPVPU BMSIFBZHGSPN UI  
the building lobby because the door is closed, if it will eventually travel through  
UIF MPCCZ QFSIBamei PC KUF B UF YGSP R G UFI C V J ME  
tamei BMSFBZ OPX FWFO XIJMF UIF BQBS UNFOU  
tuma latzeAs of tuma latze T F FDUJWFMzamei Bamei Funtibe T JPO  
JO NVDI UIF TBNF XBZ amei PCOPV B S IUBFOE S JONF  
tuma latzethuma TQSFBE T UISPVHI UIBU BSFBamei O UIF  
XPVME DBVTJOH FWFSZUIJamei C Bamei Funtibe on IUBU S  
GPSFWFS UIPVHI TQSFBEJOH

# Priestly Predicaments

UIBU UIF EFDFTFE XJMM QBTT UI S P V H F V Q P O  
TBNF BMTF BQQMJFT UP NVTF Unat Fallat @ll UT DP  
FWFOUVBMMZ CF NPWFE UP B EJ F SFOU MPDB  
to storage, or to anot51>-4<004A0055>4<004D-USfn-US

ñ ô ô

# Priestly Predicaments

Q I S ~~BeTeF~~ hatuma latzet ve'ein derekh hatuma lenikane JT UIF XBZ  
ner, or characteristic of ha UP <sup>11</sup>F Y B N CBN RVPUFT UIJT QBSU  
WBSJPVT<sup>2</sup> DPOUFYUT  
4PNF PG UIF DPNNF ~~DeleB hatuma lazet~~ VTNF EUBNF  
TZOPOZN ~~Bov tum X latzet~~ PXFWFS EFTQJUF UIF TJNJ  
UJPO JO TPNF PUIFS DBTFT BMNPTU BMM BEN  
QISBTF XJUI <sup>13</sup>U B B U J O I N T O B E N P V O U T U P J T B U B  
NFSF VTBHF ~~Delekh hatuma lazet ve'ein derekh hatuma lenikane~~  
OPU OFDFTTBSJMZ QSPWF UIBU BOZ QBSUJDV

Rabbi David Shabtai

\* G UIFSF JT B DPSQTF JO B IPVTF XJUI O  
FOUSBODFXBZT CF DPONFF FOUSBODF PQFOFE  
istamei and all the others taleor \* G UIFSF XBT JOUFOUJ  
DPSQTF UISPVHI POF PG UIF FOUSBODF JNP S  
<UIBU FOUSBODFXBZT W QSPUFDUT UIF PUIF  
beingameji î ò

\* O IJT DPNNFOUBSZ PO .JTIOB OIBMPU 3BTI  
UIBU BOZ QM BMD FNBS PFWX FOSVBM MaZne EReddy JT D  
now, since sofo shel met latzet derekh shabHIF DPSQTF XJMM FWF  
areameiî ó \* O B MPDBUJPO XJUI NV Nadei QM Suf F YJUT  
UJNF UIBU POF JT TFMFDUFE GPS SFNPWBM F  
QBSUJDVMBt Smā UBUC TJP' GIBSJCFO :FÜJFM 3PT  
XFMM BT UIF MBUFS so Runn EioU B UPPSQM BJOMUJ Ø  
ics of the Mishnâô  
%FWJBUJOH GSPN UIJT BQQSPBDI 3BNCBN  
EJ FSFOUMZ

\* G BMM UIF FOUSBODFXBZT BSF MPDLFE  
HSBWF FSFGPSF BOZCPEZ XIP taleuT JO  
"OE UIJT JT XIBU UIFZ TBU Eatoiall of its MrFE IP  
SPVOEJOHT u "OE JG IF PQFOFE POF PG  
SFNPWJOH UIF DPSQTF GSPN B QBSUJDVM  
OPU ZFU PQFOFE UIBU FOUSBODFWUIJT QS  
<GSPNadei JJOH



## Priestly Predicaments

XIJDI UIF DPSQTF JT MZJOH BSF DUNE TFE 8IJM  
GSPN TQSFBEJOH CFZPOEÿUÿIF DPO OFT PG UI

Rabbi David Shabtai

SFWFBMT UIBU B IPVTF XJUIkDvBafmE EPPST J

UP CF DPNQMFUFMZ TFQBSBUF GSPN UIF SPPN  
 and innehel BSF POMZ IBMG BT F FDUJWF &TTFOL  
 GVODUJPO MJLF B APOtEmx BS PNB M OUFF Sm QHF Z C  
 QSPthoD JUJFNT DPOUBJOFE UarfeS FCVOUGSPNOCEJD  
 venttuma GSPN FYJUJOH \*O PUIFS XPSE EofeisXIFO B  
 located within a largehel that containsma UIFZ Q SaPd PDK FBOUZT UIF  
 BSF IPVTJOH CasePH However, DnPaldateH within a container or  
 TNBhM QSF BET CFZPOE UIPTF TNBMMheS J OUSVD  
 which they are found.

3BCCJ +PTFQI ,BSP FYQMB tuOnAbylhvKingO JEJS  
 sof tuma latze64 JODF SFTthRPJCKH DUFG SthreQuireS TNBMM  
 USBWFSTJOH UIF BJS SotOnA DafzeP GresJ the largeS HFS P  
 to betamei FWFO QSJPS UP iHbwevrdRabbDavid Pardo WBM  
 TUSPOHMZ EJTBSHFFT XJUI UIJT BQQSPBDI BC  
 NFOU JOU PihkhorTubhat MetöPFBMTP OPUFT UIBU 3B  
 HFTUJPO JT BDUVBMMZ B SFTUBUFNFUO PG 3I  
 XJUI 3BNCBNT WJFX PG UIF SFMBWhalimO ITIJQ C  
 Rabbi Pardo views the suggestioKasief MishneBT TP JNQMBVTJCM  
 BCTPMVUFMZ JODPSSFDU \*O GBDU 3BCCJ ,B  
 B QPTTJCMJUZ FOEJOH IJT DPNNFUO XJUI U  
 iTUJMM OFFET GVSUIFS SFWJFXu

#VJMEJOH VQPSOshamimB.EDAMZBTCJCFSTIPO tB  
 -FJOFS SFTPMWFT UIF DPOUSBE JIEUFYCOMBZOFTDU  
 OPSNunM DZO POMZ TQHF B V UX DUUOCB ZPOE JUT  
 relevant question is whetherra DPOUBJOFE Xhels also consiTNBMM  
 FSFE UP CF XJUIJO UIFoneKJ/S XTIEDD Uwhere TNG MU  
 found, such that thera TIPVME TQSFBE UISPVHIPVU UIF M

Rabbi David Shabtai

DBO CF TBJE UP CF TVCTVNFE XJUIJO UIF PVU  
 is not true and tuma EPFT OPU TQSF BE INVARS UIF PVUFS  
 \*O DPNQMFUFMZ SFKFDUJOH BOZS SFMBU  
 tuma latzet CPUJ 3BCCJ 1BSEP BOE 3BCCJ -FJOF  
 BQQMJFT Uneh BTVCZCTMBMMSXUIJO B MBSHFS P  
 B XBZ UP Sufn BVP NU URFhe Winthummers Sing the larger  
 ohel 4VDI B TJUVBUJPO DPVME Bhe was located BO  
 VTI BHBJOTU BO FYJU GSPN UIF tami SHCKS POF  
 DPVME CF SFNPW Fhe & S NP VUFJUNBMMF FOUF  
 of the larger one. In light of the rules of tuma latzet he tumawould not  
 TQSFBE JOUHE XIJF DM BSHMMS Eahor Accord Sing No this  
 FYQBOEFE VOEFSTUBOEJOH PG 3BNCBN T BQ  
 FYJUT BSF O Puma Status For the Outer S long as the rela  
 UJPOTIJQ o Pa On UTFTU XDP UIBU POF JT TVCTVNFE  
 tuma contained within the inner ohel JT DPOTJEFSFE UP IBWF  
 the outer ohelas well.

#Z JOUSPEVDJOH UIJT QBSUJDVMBS BQQS  
 inner ohel TVCTVNFE XJUIJO B MBSHFS POF 3BNCE  
 the invocation of tuma latzet



" " IPVTF UIBU IBT CFFO TQMJU <TFQBSBU  
 XJUI TIFFUT XIFUIFS <TVTQFOEFE> GSPN U  
 horizontally beneath the roof, such that the two areas are located above  
 POF BOPUIFS> PS GSPN UIF SPPG <J F UI  
 UIBU UIF TFQBSBUFE BSFBT BSftuma and DBUFE  
 UIF IPVTF VUFOTJMT MPDBU Fhe ohel P S CF  
 istuma JO UIF TFQBSBUJPO tami EOTJMT JO UI  
 © \*G IF TFQBSBUFE <UIF IPVTF JOUP UXP>  
 QMBDFE IPSJ[POUBMMZ TVDI UIBU UIF TFC  
 if there is tuma JO UIF TFQBSBUJPO tami EOTJMT JO  
 tuma JO UIF IPVTF BOE VUFOTJMT JO UIF TFC  
 JO BO BSFB PG <U Fhe Sufn for> JBOOPDVCJIF U

# Priestly Predicaments

JO BO BSFB TNBMUMJESLalBneisP@FheDm@d D  
MFWFM PG B IPVTF BOE EPXOXBSET IBT UI  
XIJDI JU JartzM@BajREmohu ad hatehom

Rabbi David Shabtai

3BNCBN JO MJOF XJUI IJT DPOStUtrbaFOU E  
 latzet FYQMbjOT UIBU S Fair Bo Ed MHe Tarrie Causes Fie U  
 SFBS BOE VQQFS BSFB T halim ABON Bn they are BnTy JOEF  
 F FDUJWF Joma QSPWB OUE OJO UIF SFTU PG UIF  
 UIF CBSSJFS C Vudha MBPOCBPUF EQ SFWJFOEU UIF CBSS  
 CFZPOE JUT D Pone Qry Ton the Mishna BNCBN FYQMJDJU  
 5PTF B ,FMJN a a BOE FWFO XIJMF OPU NBLJ  
 these cases describe d milk Tumat Met IF SFGFST UP IJT QSFV  
 PG UIF SFMBUJJPOTIJQ CFUXFFO JOOFS BOE P

¥ " <XPPEFO> DIFTU MPD Btuma, the House is P V T F  
 tamei <BT XFM Mtaim, the House, that Which is in the chest  
 istahor TJODF JU Juma BUQ SPYQJUS B D SPQEKH UP F  
 hatuma latzet ve'ein darkah lehikanes

§ \*G <UIF XPPEFO DIFTU> JCFM P DIB U F C F W B  
 XJUI JUT PQFOJOH GBDJOH PVUXBSET BOE  
 tainstuma the house ish, or if there it remain the house, that which is  
 in the chest tamei TJODF JU Juma BUQ SPYQJUS B D EP G P U  
 shederekh hatuma latzet ve'ein darkah] lehikanes

" T BO BQQBSFOU Sotama Natzer N B O Z M P N G F O U B U P S  
 these mishnayot B D D P S E J O H U F S B N C M Q S F O Z J R M W F J O H I  
 of sof tuma latzet 3 B N C B N J O U F S R A Y S I F P N F U I F B U F E J F S F O  
 E F T D S J C F T U I F D I F T U M P D H E W I F I E A N H E U I J S C W F B U P  
 JOH IJT P R V P U F E F Y Q M B O B U J P O h e l i s J u b J T B C  
 TVNFE XJUI JOE Beor Pharis Sumais located within the inner  
 ohel the outer ohel tamei u S F G F S S J O H U I F S F B W F S U P 5 P  
 the tumais located within the chest, the house is considered chelander  
 istamei Conversely, when the tumais located in the house, the ohel U I F  
 XPPEFO DIFTU m D B O t u m a S F O M F P O U U I F T Q B S I F B B B P  
 UP OE UIJT OPUJPO TP QFSWB T J W F M Z J N Q P S  
 B ( F O U J P O i m U e r l a z e h T J O D F J U J T B O J N Q P S U B O U  
 yesod gadol u ) F D P E J F T U I F H i l k h o t T O r a t M e s V M J O J U J O  
 P V U N V D I F M B C P S B U J P O

F UIJSE NJTIOB UIPVHI BQQBBSNTC BNP TQ S  
 BQQSPBDI \* O U C F o r m e n t a y O n t h e M i s h n a N B A D P T N O P O U  
 PO UIJT TFDUJPO CVU JOTUFBE G H K D o V T u m a t F Y D M  
 Met ¥ ~ " IF DJUFT UIF .JTIOB GBJUIGVMMZ XJU  
 IJT JOUFSQSFUBUJPO PG UIF STU NJTIOB JU  
 records that when tumais found within the chest the house tamei Regard  
 MFTT PG XIFSF UIF DIFTU JT MPDBUFE XJUIJO

"" 01BMPU " ¥ m §  
 " © 3 B T I B O E 3 P T I P C h e l e r M F U B ' S B N t h a C e B a d i a l i B a t e n u r a , i b i d . ,  
 s.v.habayit Tiferet Yisrael

Rabbi David Shabtai

J E F O U J F E ד ב ר U I F J O O F S





Rabbi David Shabtai

# Priestly Predicaments

EFTDSJCFT OVNFSPTV DBTFT a " ¥¤ "m© ¥« ©

Rabbi David Shabtai

However, since the innel JT TVCTVNFE XheLabdo UIF P  
 JOH UP 3BNCOn X UMM PVEU FSN F  
 r 3BNCBN T FYQ BOE T JWN BZJ BXP B DSFBUF T J  
 GFSFODFT 6OEFSTUBOEJOH UIF DBTF PG  
 doors as in the analysis above, he would declare the outside surfaces  
 any of those doors to be BOE T JWN BZJ BXP B should there be  
 B SPPG BCPWF U Ison Numaxatzare, the Sur side sur



Rabbi David Shabtai

QBSUT DBO CF QSFTFOU JO EJWFSTF WFOVFT  
 DFSUBJ ~~Qmb~~ ~~BSFTD~~ ~~PG~~ UBJOFE XJUIJO EJTQMBZ D  
 "TTVNJOH UIBU UIFTF BSFT ~~uhf~~ ~~TPNFZU~~ ~~QPUHF~~ ~~DIJUE~~  
 JOWFTUJHBUJPO UIF QFSNJTTJCJMJUZ PG B  
 UIF EJTBSFFNFOU CFUXFFO 3BNCBN BOE UIF  
 %JTQMBZ DBTFT QSFTFOU TFWFSBM JTT  
 the question of ~~thema~~'T PSJHJO NFOUJPOFE FBSMJF  
 UIF DBTF JT PG QSJNF JNQPSUBOD ~~Fuma~~T JODF  
 then it does not qualify as ~~shel~~ UP Q ~~Sra~~ ~~WFS~~ ~~SRUN~~ FYJUJOH VC  
 DJSDVNTUBODFT VOMFTT QFSNBOFOUMZ B  
 (haba bemidda J F MBSHFS ~~U7B~~ ~~Span~~ ~~W-2E~~ ~~F2B~~ ~~DC~~ ~~BZ~~ ~~C2~~ ~~1R~~

## Priestly Predicaments

"TTVNJOH UUBOPB\$ DQBDF JT QSFTFOU BOE  
OPU TVTDFQUJOMFUUP EJTDPMBZID BTU UBLFT P

ñ ö ò